CHAPTER 10

The rights of lesbians and gay men
10.1 Introduction ................................................................. 228
10.2 Sexual orientation and HIV/AIDS discrimination .......... 229
   10.2.1 Discriminatory laws ........................................ 229
   10.2.2 Unfair discrimination in the implementation of laws .... 230
   10.2.3 Social prejudice ........................................... 230
   10.2.4 Double discrimination ...................................... 231
10.3 Young lesbian and gay people and HIV/AIDS .............. 232
   10.3.1 Social prejudice ........................................... 232
   10.3.2 Sexuality education at school ............................ 232
   10.3.3 Age of consent ............................................ 234
10.4 Lesbian and gay partners and families ........................ 235
   10.4.1 Home ......................................................... 235
   10.4.2 Work ......................................................... 236
      Medical aid assistance ....................................... 236
      Compassionate leave ........................................... 236
      Pension and provident funds ................................ 237
      Occupational injuries ......................................... 237
   10.4.3 Social services ............................................. 238
10.5 Medical care ............................................................. 240
10.6 Planning ahead .......................................................... 241
   10.6.1 Care and treatment decisions ............................. 241
   10.6.2 Household goods, money and property ................. 241
10.7 Conclusion ............................................................... 243

Talking points ............................................................. 244

References and resource materials ................................. 245
The gay, lesbian, bisexual and transgendered communities have faced much of the blame, discrimination and prejudice linked with HIV/AIDS.

In fact, the first name given to HIV/AIDS was ‘GRID’ or ‘gay-related immune deficiency’. Together with people from Haiti, gay men were among the first people to be diagnosed with HIV/AIDS.

For many people, homosexuality was always seen as a sin, crime or disease. Over hundreds of years, people were executed and sent to jail. Others lost their jobs, homes, education, children and even their families because of the idea that same-sex relations were sinful, criminal or pathological (sick). The HIV/AIDS epidemic has encouraged this kind of prejudice and discrimination.

The Equality Clause in the Bill of Rights makes our Constitution the first in the world to give rights to lesbians and gay men by making it against the law to unfairly discriminate against someone because of their sexual orientation.

But there are still old laws, and social prejudices that discriminate directly and indirectly against lesbians and gay men. Also, the way that some laws and rights are used disadvantage lesbians and gay men.

Our Constitution protects the rights of all people, but some old laws still discriminate against lesbians and gay men.
Discrimination against lesbians, gays, bisexual and transgendered people happens in different ways.

10.2.1 DISCRIMINATORY LAWS

Some of our laws have directly discriminated against people because of their sexual orientation, for example:

- The Sexual Offences Act has a different age of consent (the age when men and women can decide that they want to have sex) for heterosexual people and homosexual people. Heterosexual people may have sex with each other at the age of 16, while lesbian or gay people can only consent to sex at the age of 19.

- The old common law crimes of sodomy and “unnatural acts” (eg oral sex, masturbation) prohibited consenting sex between men (where both men agree to have sex).

DOING AWAY WITH OUTDATED LAWS

- The Department of Health: HIV/AIDS & STD Strategic Plan for South Africa 2000–2005 has called for these laws to be withdrawn.

- The South African Law Commission (SALC) has recommended in its review of the Sexual Offences Act that the age of consent should be the same for heterosexual and homosexual people.

SODOMY NO LONGER A CRIME

During 1997, the National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality (NCGLE) and the South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC) challenged the common law crime of sodomy as unconstitutional.

In NCGLE and the SAHRC v Minister of Justice and the Attorney-General of the Witwatersrand (1998), the Constitutional Court decided it is no longer a crime for men to have sex with men.
10.2.2 UNFAIR DISCRIMINATION IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF LAWS

Sometimes it is not the laws themselves, but the way that laws are implemented that unfairly discriminates against gay and lesbian people so that they do not get access to their rights, benefits and services.

IMPLEMENTATION OF MEDICAL SCHEMES ACT

The Medical Schemes Act specifically allows same-sex partners to be registered as dependants on a medical scheme. But many companies still exclude same-sex partners from medical schemes.

10.2.3 SOCIAL PREJUDICE

There is still a lot of social prejudice against lesbians and gay men from their families, in the community, in the workplace, in schools, churches and in public services.

THE TARGETING OF LESBIAN YOUTHS

Many lesbian youths are raped in South Africa every day. Often these rapes are committed by men who claim that they will change these lesbian youths into heterosexual women.

KEY POINT

SEXUAL ORIENTATION

You cannot change someone’s sexual orientation through rape or in other ways like therapy.

There is still a lot of prejudice against gay men in some churches.
10.2.4 DOUBLE DISCRIMINATION

THE EFFECTS OF DOUBLE DISCRIMINATION

Lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgendered people often experience double discrimination:

- Discrimination because of their sexual orientation, and
- Discrimination because of HIV/AIDS.

This discrimination can put them at more risk of getting infected with HIV, and make prevention and care work much more difficult. It can also make the impact of HIV on their lives much worse.

What are the reasons for this greater risk and vulnerability?

- It is harder to do direct and open safer sex education because many people still think that same-sex acts are illegal. Very often people hide their prejudice behind outdated laws.

- Many men and women who have same-sex relationships believe their behaviour is illegal or socially unacceptable – as a result many deny to themselves, to their close family and friends and to the broader community, that they love or have sex with people of the same sex.

- Many lesbians and gay men cannot, or are afraid to, use services (like health care services, welfare services, sexuality education ) that would help to reduce the risk of HIV infection, or would help them to cope with HIV infection.

For more on challenging discrimination, see 17.2 on page 399.

For contact details of organisations and services, see R8 on page 483.
Lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgendered youth face social prejudice and legal discrimination. The lack of sexuality education and the unequal age of consent are two clear areas of unfair discrimination. This places them at greater risk of getting sexually transmissible diseases (STDs) and HIV.

**10.3.1 SOCIAL PREJUDICE**

Many lesbian and gay youth face harassment at school, in their communities and even in their families because of their sexual orientation.

In 1990, the United States Department of Health and Human Services published a report on Youth Suicide. The report found that “gay youth are 2 to 3 times more likely to attempt suicide than other young people”. Up to 30% of completed youth suicides annually involved gay youth. The report concluded:

> The root of the problem of gay youth suicide is a society that discriminates against and stigmatises homosexuals while failing to recognise that a substantial number of its youth has a gay or lesbian orientation.

**THE EFFECT OF SOCIAL PREJUDICE**

In 1994, a 16-year old lesbian contacted the Centre for Applied Legal Studies for assistance. She regularly faced harassment at school. At home, her divorced mother and the mother’s boyfriend physically assaulted her on a daily basis because she was lesbian. Her father and stepmother also harassed and threatened her about her sexual orientation.

The Social Services were asked to remove her from her mother’s custody. They delayed. Two weeks later, she stabbed her mother’s boyfriend with a knife when he assaulted her again.

**10.3.2 SEXUALITY EDUCATION AT SCHOOL**

Sexuality education ignores, avoids or misrepresents same-sex practices or relationships. Most of the HIV/AIDS prevention materials aimed at school students and youth do not discuss same-sex relations. They are silent about the needs of young people who are not heterosexual, and often young people cannot get access to any information about same-sex practices.
Most of the safer sex tools, like condoms, that are available in South Africa, are not suitable for lesbian or gay safer sex. Lesbian safer sex tools like dental dams, female condoms and rubber gloves are not distributed widely by the Department of Health. Some of the condoms available in South Africa are not suitable for anal sex, and do not come with lubricant (eg KY jelly, Aqueous cream).

The Constitution prohibits unfair discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation. This was strengthened by the new Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act of 2000 (also called the Equality Act). The Constitution also says that every child has the right to a basic education and that every person has the right to receive information.

The South African Schools Act also prohibits any form of unfair discrimination and the Gauteng Education Act specifically prohibits unfair discrimination because of a person’s sexual orientation.

THE RIGHT TO SEXUALITY EDUCATION

- Lesbian and gay students and youth have a right to get suitable information, sexuality education or life-skills training on how to protect themselves.
- If you don’t get the information you need, you should contact an organisation for help to enforce these rights.

Sexuality education must deal with the needs and questions of all young people, not only those who are heterosexual.
10.3.3 AGE OF CONSENT

The Sexual Offences Act makes the age of consenting to sex unequal for lesbian and gay youth. For heterosexuals, the age of consent is 16, but for same-sex activity, the age of consent is 19. This means that it is still illegal for young gay men and lesbians to have sex. It is possible that anyone found to be guilty of this “crime” could be prosecuted and sent to jail.

RELATIONSHIP WITH A YOUTH OF 16

In 1995, the Centre for Applied Legal Studies (CALS) was contacted by an 18-year old male youth who had a relationship with a youth of 16. The family and church found out and charges of sodomy were brought against the 18-year old.

After CALS took up the case, the charges were dropped by the Attorney-General.

It is not enough to rely on the goodwill of an Attorney-General who decided not to prosecute – a different Attorney-General may have decided to prosecute lesbian and gay youths or their partners. While many changes to the law have benefited gay men and lesbians, this part of the Sexual Offences Act has still not been withdrawn.

UNEQUAL AGE OF CONSENT INCREASES THE RISK OF HIV INFECTION

In R v M (1989), which challenged the unequal age of consent, the Ontario Court of Appeals said that Canadian law was unfair and unconstitutional. It also put young people at risk of HIV infection:

Unmarried, heterosexual adolescents 14 or over can participate in consensual intercourse without criminal penalties; gay adolescents cannot … The health education they should be receiving to protect them from avoidable harm may be curtailed, since it may be interpreted as counselling young people about a form of sexual conduct the law prohibits.

THE EFFECT OF OUR UNEQUAL AGE OF CONSENT

The unequal age of consent adds to the prejudice against lesbian and gay relationships in South Africa and also hinders adequate sexuality education in high schools.

The South African Law Commission (SALC) has recommended that these laws are changed.

To find SALC documents, see References and resource materials on page 245.
Currently, the marriage laws in South Africa do not recognise the partnerships or unions (marriages) of lesbian and gay people. They do not recognise that many lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgendered people live together intimately in a variety of family relationships. The marriage laws also discriminate against common law unions of heterosexual people.

This kind of discrimination is often more harsh for lesbian and gay people living with HIV or AIDS, or another life-threatening condition.

**THE EFFECT OF LOSING A PARTNER**

If a partner dies of AIDS, the surviving partner may lose the joint home, medical aid, or pension if their rights to the joint properties and services are not recognised by law.

**SALC INVESTIGATION**
The South African Law Commission is investigating the law on partnerships and marriages, including same-sex relationships.

### 10.4.1 HOME

If you are a lesbian or gay person living in a rented house or flat, and the lease is in the name of your lesbian or gay partner who has HIV or AIDS, you may face discrimination. If your partner dies and the lease was in his/her name, you can be evicted.

**STEPS TO TAKE ON LEASES AND EVICTIONS**
If you are in this position, ask the landlord/lady to change the lease to include both partners.

If you own your own home, make sure that it is registered jointly or that you have a will.

If you are faced by an eviction, make use of the Constitution which says:

> No one may be evicted from their home, or have their home demolished, without an order of court made after considering all the relevant circumstances. No legislation may permit arbitrary evictions.

s26 (3) of Bill of Rights
10.4.2 WORK

Lesbians and gay men face a lot of discrimination at work, eg in hiring, promotion and benefits.

**Medical aid assistance**

Lesbian and gay employees were often not allowed to register their same-sex partners on their medical aid schemes.

The *Labour Relations Act* specifically prohibits discrimination on the grounds of sexual orientation and marital status, in line with the Constitution.

The *Medical Schemes Act* says it is against the law for medical aid schemes to refuse to register a same-sex partner.

**MEDICAL AID DISCRIMINATION**

In *Langemaat v Minister of Safety and Security* (1998), a lesbian who worked for the police, wanted to add her partner to her medical aid as a ‘dependant’, but was not allowed to because the medical aid did not include same-sex partners as dependants. The High Court said that this was discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation.

**GUIDELINES**

Refer any people still experiencing unfair discrimination by medical aid schemes to the Registrar at the Council for Medical Schemes.

**Compassionate leave**

The Labour Relations Act allows for compassionate leave – this is an equal right for people in same-sex relationships. Compassionate leave makes it possible for people to take leave when their partner or a close relative dies or is very ill.

**COMPASSIONATE LEAVE DISCRIMINATION**

If a company discriminates on the grounds of sexual orientation in giving compassionate leave, this is an unfair labour practice.

You can challenge this at the *Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration (CCMA)*.
Pension and provident funds

In the past, when a lesbian or gay person died without a will, their partner often did not get the pension or provident fund payout.

**PENSION FUND DISCRIMINATION**

In 1999, the NCGLE helped a client to make a complaint to the Pension Fund Adjudicator so that he could get his same-sex partner's pension fund after the partner's death.

The Closed Pension Fund Amendment Act of 1999 makes sure that the surviving same-sex partner of a lesbian or gay person has a right to be paid out from his/her partner's pension fund. This can happen even if the deceased partner did not list the surviving partner as a beneficiary (person to inherit).

**Occupational injuries**

If a lesbian or gay worker is infected with HIV as a result of an accident at work, the current law discriminates unfairly on the grounds of sexual orientation and marital status. “Worker’s Compensation” only pays out to “spouses” (as defined in marriage laws, customary and religious unions) or children.

**CHALLENGING COMPENSATION LAW**

- Under current compensation law, a same-sex partner will not be paid out for workplace injuries or illness.
- This law is discriminatory and should be challenged.
10.4.3 SOCIAL SERVICES

In getting access to social services, lesbian and gay families were often discriminated against in the way that “family” or “household” was defined.

Many government benefits depended on a person being a member of a family or a household. Many private and public organisations also did not include lesbian and gay families in their definition of family.

Now, a number of new laws have changed the definition of family. The new definitions include gay and lesbian relationships and households. This helps lesbian and gay families to get access to services (like health services, or pension payouts) that can help to reduce the effect of HIV/AIDS on their lives.

WELFARE DEPARTMENT
DEFINITION OF ‘FAMILY’

The 1997 White Paper on Social Welfare clearly says that:

- People with a “homosexual or bisexual preference will not be excluded from social services”.
- Lesbian and gay youth, as well as young people with HIV or AIDS, are included in its youth programme development.

Same-sex couples also raise their children in an atmosphere of love and stability.
The White Paper defines family as:

- Individuals who either by agreement or contract choose to live together intimately and function as a unit in a social and economic system. The family is the primary social unit which ideally provides care, nurturing and socialisation for its members. It seeks to provide them with physical, economic, emotional, social, cultural and spiritual security. The various family forms and structures are acknowledged in this document.

The Department of Social Development’s commitment to including lesbian and gay people in its programmes is a valuable example to use in making all government departments rethink their programmes and policies.

**NEW LAWS WITH A BROADER DEFINITION OF ‘FAMILY’**

Some of the new laws that include lesbian and gay families in their definition of ‘family’ are:

- The Medical Schemes Act
- The Promotion of Equality and Prevention of Unfair Discrimination Act
- The Closed Pension Fund Amendment Act
- The Domestic Violence Act.

Private and public organisations should change their definitions of ‘family’ to include lesbian and gay relationships, so that lesbians and gay men can also get services that are offered to families.

If you or your partner are excluded from getting social services, you can challenge this using the Equality Clause in the Bill of Rights of the Constitution.
Whenever gay or lesbian people visit health care facilities for the first time, the staff always assume that they are heterosexual. People are often scared to say that they are gay or lesbian, because the doctor or health care worker may be homophobic (have negative or prejudiced feelings towards lesbians and gay men).

It is important for doctors to know the sexual orientation of their patients. But once doctors know this, they have to respect the privacy and confidentiality of the patient.

If a doctor or any health care worker discriminates against you because you are lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgendered, they are breaching:

- Their duty to give the best care and treatment to patients, and
- Their constitutional duty to equal treatment of all patients.

In future, they will also be going against the National Health Bill (and a future new Health Care Act) which prohibits discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation.

**STEPS TO TAKE TO CHALLENGE UNFAIR MEDICAL TREATMENT**

You can challenge the action of the doctor or health care worker:

If you do not receive adequate medical treatment or care because a health care worker is homophobic, you can:

- Make a civil or constitutional case against the hospital or clinic, or
- Complain to a professional body, eg the Health Professions Council of South Africa (HPCSA).
10.6 Planning ahead

10.6.1 CARE AND TREATMENT DECISIONS

EXCLUSION OF A LESBIAN PARTNER FROM TREATMENT AND CARE DECISIONS

The Equal Rights Project of the National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality was contacted by a lesbian woman, Susan. She and her partner Helen had been in a relationship for 15 years. Both of their families knew and relations between them were warm.

Helen suddenly became ill and went into a coma. During this period, she was hospitalised and Helen’s parents attempted to exclude Susan from all decision-making about her treatment and care.

The interference of families and attempts to exclude partners from care and treatment decisions is a reality for many lesbian and gay people. When a same-sex couple are dealing with HIV or AIDS, this becomes even more of a problem.

Lesbian and gay couples should plan ahead to set their wishes down in writing, and to make sure that their partners are included in the decision making.

10.6.2 HOUSEHOLD GOODS, MONEY AND PROPERTY

Intestate succession deals with what happens when someone dies without a will.

South Africa’s intestate succession laws do not yet recognise lesbian and gay couples. Because lesbian and gay unions are still not always recognised by a partner’s family, lesbian and gay couples should make clear wills saying how they wish to deal with their estate (eg their shares in joint property, their individual property and money in the bank). If they don’t do this, the surviving partner may get nothing.
PENSION FUND PAYOUT TO A GAY PARTNER

Up until 1999, pension and provident fund payouts were made to next-of-kin (closest surviving family) when lesbian and gay people died. This often meant that the partner of the deceased lesbian or gay person got nothing.

In Martin v Beka Provident Fund (1999), the Pension Funds Adjudicator said that the surviving gay partner was the primary (most important) surviving next-of-kin and gave the pension fund payout to him.

THE IMPORTANCE OF FUTURE PLANNING

- Lesbian and gay couples may find that their partners don't have the power (by law) to make important decisions for them when they are sick, or are not able to inherit from them when they die.
- It is vital to discuss with lesbian and gay clients what their future plans are and to advise them to draw up a will, living will and power of attorney.
- Copies of these documents can be given to medical professionals and, where necessary, to religious advisers, families and legal advisers. In this way, you can avoid a lot of the trauma and legal difficulties.
South Africa’s Constitution is the first in the world to clearly prohibit discrimination against lesbians and gays in its Bill of Rights. However, discrimination still carries on, and the HIV/AIDS epidemic has increased the climate of discrimination.

Lesbian and gay people throughout the world have played a leading role in HIV/AIDS prevention, care and treatment efforts. Based on their experience of discrimination, homophobia and ‘AIDS-phobia’ (fear of AIDS), they have also contributed to the struggle for equality of people living with HIV or AIDS.

Lesbian and gay people with HIV or AIDS need to continue playing this role to deal with the new legal issues and challenges around HIV/AIDS, and the double discrimination still faced by people because of their medical condition and their sexual orientation.
Talking points

1. Do you think it is fair to have a different age of consent for heterosexual and same-sex activity?

2. What do you think should be the age of consent to sex for youth in South Africa?

3. The South African Law Commission is investigating the laws on partnerships and unions, including same-sex relationships. Do you think that the law should:
   - Stay the same so that same-sex relationships are not recognised by law?
   - Have special laws for same-sex partnerships?
   - Make the law the same as for a heterosexual marriage?

4. What do you think of the Department of Social Development’s White Paper’s definition of ‘family’ (see 10.4.3 on page 238)?

5. Do you think homophobia and AIDS-phobia (fear of AIDS) work together to discriminate against lesbian and gay people?

6. What can be done to challenge discrimination because of homophobia and AIDS-phobia?
REFERENCES & RESOURCE MATERIALS

LAWs

Closed Pension Fund Amendment Act, No 41 of 1999.
Medical Schemes Act, No 131 of 1998.
Sexual Offences Act, No 23 of 1957.
South African Schools Act, No 84 of 1996.

POLICY DOCUMENTS


CASES

Langemaat v Minister of Safety and Security and Others, 1998 (4) BLCR 444 (T).
Martin v Beka Provident Fund, 1999.
National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality and Others v Minister of Home Affairs and others, 2000 (2) SA 1 (CC).
National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality and Another v Minister of Justice and Others, 1999 (1) SA 6 (CC).
R v M (C), Ontario Court of Appeals, Canada, 98 CCC.3d.481.
REPORTS, MANUALS AND OTHER USEFUL MATERIALS


NCGLE: Young, Out and Proud (pamphlet for young people who are lesbian, gay, bisexual or transgendered), 1999.

NCGLE/Gay and Lesbian Legal Advice Centre: Recognising our Relationships – A guide to claim benefits for lesbian and gay partners (pamphlet), undated.


WEBSITES

AIDS Law Project: www.alp.org.za

AIDS Legal Network: www.redribbon.co.za/legal

Commission on Gender Equality: www.cge.org.za

Department of Health resources: www.aidsinfo.co.za

Lesbian and Gay Equality Project: www.equality.org.za


UNAIDS: www.unaids.org